



County Hall  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW  
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir  
Caerdydd  
CF10 4UW  
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

## PAPURAU ATODOL

<b>Pwyllgor</b>	PWYLLGOR ARCHWILIO
<b>Dyddiad ac amser y cyfarfod</b>	DYDD LLUN, 18 MEDI 2017, 2.00 PM
<b>Lleoliad</b>	YSTAFELL BWYLLGORA 4 - NEUADD Y SIR
<b>Aelodaeth</b>	Aelodau Annibynnol: Ian Arundale (Cadeirydd) Hugh Thomas, Gavin McArthur and David Price YCynghorwyr Bale, Cowan, Cunnah, Howells, Lay, McGarry, Dianne Rees a/ac Singh

Y papurau canlynol wedi'i farcio ' i ddilyn' ar yr agenda a ddsbarthwyd yn flaenorol

### Eitem 6.2

#### Datganiad Gweithredu

Atodiad A - Datganiad Gweithredu Gweithredu Cyngor Caerdydd mewn Ymateb i Adroddiad Dilynol Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru

Atodiad B - Adroddiad Cynnydd Datganiad Gweithredu Gweithredu Cyngor Caerdydd 31 Gorffennaf 2017

Atodiad C - A all y Cyngor ddangos cynnydd digonol wrth gwrdd â chynigion ar gyfer gwella a wnaed ym mis Chwefror 2016

### **Davina Fiore**

#### **Cyfarwyddwr Llywodraethu a Gwasanaethau Cyfreithiol**

Dyddiadd: Dydd Mawrth, 12 Medi 2017

Cyswllt: Graham Porter, 029 2087 3401, [g.porter@caerdydd.gov.uk](mailto:g.porter@caerdydd.gov.uk)

Mae'r dudalen hon yn wag yn fwriadol

**AUDIT COMMITTEE: 18 SEPTEMBER 2017**

---

**MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO 2016/17 STATUTORY IMPROVEMENT  
REPORT****REPORT OF CORPORATE DIRECTOR RESOURCES****AGENDA ITEM: 6.2**

---

**Reason for this Report**

1. To present to the Audit Committee the Council's Progress Report on the Statement of Action agreed by Cabinet in March 2016 in response to the Wales Audit Office's February 2016 Corporate Assessment Follow On Report.
2. To allow Audit Committee to consider the progress made.

**Background**

3. In autumn 2015, the Wales Audit Office undertook a Follow On to their 2014 Corporate Assessment. The findings of this work were published in February 2016 in their Corporate Assessment Follow On Report.
4. The Follow On Report contained one Recommendation: "The Council must ensure that it addresses the proposals for improvement as set out in this report to deliver improved outcomes within the next 12 months"

**Cardiff Council Response**

5. In response to this recommendation, the Council developed a Statement of Action (Appendix A) that detailed how the Council would address the findings of the Follow On Report.
6. In addition to the Recommendation, the Follow On Report also contained 14 Proposals for Improvement, spread across four areas of the Council's activity: Leadership and Management; Governance; Performance Reporting; Corporate Enablers.
7. The Council's Statement of Action is therefore structured around these Proposals for Improvement.

**Reason for Report**

8. The Council's Statement of Action Progress Report (Appendix B) details the work that has been undertaken in response to the findings of the WAO's Follow On report.
9. The Statement of Action has now been completed, with any outstanding work due to be incorporated into the Council's business as usual activity. This approach has been agreed with the Wales Audit Office.

## **Wales Audit Office Local Work**

10. As part of its 2016-17 work programme for Cardiff Council, the Wales Audit Office undertook a range of fieldwork in spring 2017 centred on understanding how successful the Council had been in addressing the Proposals for Improvement contained within the Corporate Assessment Follow On Report.
11. In addition to this work, the Wales Audit Office also considered the Council's progress updates on its Statement of Action.
12. At the conclusion of this activity, the Wales Audit Office issued the report "Can the Council demonstrate sufficient progress in meeting proposals for improvement made in February 2016?" (Appendix C).
13. The main finding of this report is "The Council can demonstrate sufficient progress in implementing the 2016 proposals for improvement and is in the process of embedding new performance management and reporting arrangements, but a decline in the proportion of staff completing mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection needs to be resolved".

### **Legal Implications**

14. There are no legal implications directly arising from this report.

### **Financial Implications**

15. There are no financial implications directly arising from this report.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

16. To note the Council's progress against the Statement of Action.

**CHRISTINE SALTER**  
**CORPORATE DIRECTOR RESOURCES**  
**18<sup>th</sup> September 2017**

*The following appendices are attached*

- Appendix A: Cardiff Council Statement of Action in Response to WAO Follow On Report – March 2016
- Appendix B: Cardiff Council Statement of Action Progress Report – July 2017
- Appendix C: WAO Report: Can the council demonstrate sufficient progress in meeting proposals for improvement made in February 2016? – Cardiff Council – September 2017

**WALES AUDIT OFFICE CORPORATE ASSESSMENT FOLLOW ON REPORT –  
STATEMENT OF ACTION**

The Council welcomes the Wales Audit Office’s assessment of progress over the last two years, and recognises that, while progress has been made, momentum must be maintained to enable the Council to deliver improved services and better outcomes for the citizens of Cardiff.

**R1: Recommendation**

**The Council must ensure that it addresses the proposals for improvement as set out in this report to deliver improved outcomes within the next 12 months**

This Statement of Action has been developed in response to the single statutory recommendation of the Corporate Assessment Follow On report and addresses each of the 14 Proposals for Improvement identified by the Wales Audit Office. In addition, the Council will bring forward a report on the review and reshaping of the Council’s Organisational Development Programme (ODP) for consideration by the Cabinet in June 2016.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Lead Officer(s)</b>
R1	Undertake a review of the Council’s Organisational Development Plan (ODP)	June 2016	Chief Executive

**LEADERSHIP & MANAGEMENT**

**P1: Proposal for Improvement**

**Develop further engagement opportunities with staff and Members to consistently embed a constructive performance management culture across the organisation to help deliver improved outcomes.**

The recent staff and members’ survey results highlight the potential for further engagement opportunities to be rolled out in the next twelve months.

In terms of staff, this will involve implementation of the Programme for Engagement for 2016/17 with a strong emphasis on increased activity at directorate and team levels. Senior management roadshows; Have Your Say sessions; back to the floor meetings for managers; staff briefings; the work of staff ambassadors; and the Make the Difference social media campaign will continue to raise the profile of staff engagement and provide staff with a platform for engaging with management about the key issues facing the Council.

In relation to members, the results of a recent survey of members undertaken by the communication team is being used to focus improvements in priority areas, such as the dedicated intranet pages, consolidated weekly updates and improving technology. This will be consolidated into a Programme for Member Communications and Engagement.

The Council's Performance Management Strategy will be revised (see Proposal for Improvement 6) and launched proactively to staff and members, and represent a core theme of forthcoming engagement activity. Furthermore, the revised Strategy will focus specifically on engaging with and developing the Council's wider performance management community and with all Operational Managers. The workforce strategy strand of the Organisational Development Programme (ODP) will further ensure that engagement activities are integrated with ongoing work dealing with performance development reviews, learning and development, and workforce planning.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Lead Officer(s)</b>
	Review and refresh of the Council's programme of staff engagement	April 2016	Chief Executive
	Development of a new programme for member communications and engagement	June 2016	Monitoring Officer

## GOVERNANCE

### P2: Proposal for Improvement

Clarify the roles and responsibilities within the Council's decision making framework. In particular:

- a ensuring that meetings of the Informal Cabinet meetings are recorded appropriately;
- b ensuring that the title and roles of Assistants to Cabinet Members' are applied consistently ensuring that their limited roles and responsibilities do not cloud any accountabilities;
- c review the role and membership of Cabinet Advisory Groups to ensure that those members involved do not sit on any Scrutiny Committee responsible for scrutinising the same/similar issues; and
- d ensure that a decision is made on the issue about whether to delegate executive decision-making to individual Cabinet Members.

The governance and engagement work-stream of the ODP will be reviewed and geared towards addressing areas of improvement identified by the Wales Audit Office (WAO), supporting further improvements in decision making, scrutiny, and public engagement.

A key focus will be on ensuring that roles and responsibilities are clarified to ensure clear accountabilities in decision-making.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer(s)
P2a	Key action points from informal meetings of the Cabinet will be recorded by the Cabinet Office	May 2016	Monitoring Officer
P2b	Role description for Assistants to Cabinet Members will be included within the Council's Constitution and provided to all post-holders to assist in clarifying roles and responsibilities	July 2016	Monitoring Officer
P2c	Terms of Reference for Cabinet Advisory Groups will be agreed	July 2016	Monitoring Officer
P2d	Constitution Committee to undertake a further review of the volume and category of decisions taken by the Cabinet over the last 12 months and consider making provision within the Council's Constitution for executive decision-making to be delegated to individual Cabinet Members	September 2016	Monitoring Officer

### **P3: Proposal for Improvement**

**Further strengthen the Council's scrutiny function by:**

- a**      **developing an approach to scrutinising cross cutting issues; and**
- b**      **ensuring that any vacancies on scrutiny committees are filled quickly.**

The Council's Improving Scrutiny report, which was jointly commissioned by scrutiny committee chairs and supported by the Centre of Public Scrutiny, proposed a range of improvement actions that are currently being implemented.

Arrangements to scrutinise cross-cutting issues have been developed by the Council, including:

- Joint meetings to scrutinise cross-cutting issues including: Social Services Reporting Framework; Community Hubs; Alternative Delivery Mechanisms; and Human Trafficking.
- Joint task and finish groups, for example to consider Community Infrastructure Levy.
- Joint scrutiny with neighbouring authorities on issues including Regulatory Services and the Central South Consortium Joint Education Service.

In September 2015 it was agreed that the Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee would take lead overview role for scrutinising the work of Cardiff Partnership Board, with the other four Committees undertaking detailed scrutiny of Partnership Board work streams. The Policy Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee undertook a review of the What Matters strategy in January 2016.

Vacancies are allocated to political groups under political proportionality rules, are discussed on a monthly basis with Party Group Whips, and have been offered to other political groups and independent councillors.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Responsible Officer(s)</b>
	Implementation of the recommendations of the Improving Scrutiny Report	May 2017	Monitoring Officer
	Review of Scrutiny to be undertaken, with recommendations to be implemented from the start of the next political term	December 2016	Monitoring Officer
	Appointments to vacancies on committees to be considered as a standing item on all council meeting agendas	May 2016	Monitoring Officer
	Examine reasons why vacancies exist on committees as part of the Annual Member Survey	May 2016	Monitoring Officer



#### **P4: Proposal for Improvement**

**Ensure that all committee agendas, minutes and decision-logs are published in a timely manner on the Council's website, and increase the number of committees that are webcast.**

The deployment of modern.gov has significantly improved the Council's publication arrangements. However, it is essential that the timeliness of publication of agendas, minutes and decision logs are reviewed frequently to address any areas of outstanding concern.

Webcasting facilities are in place in County Hall and in the City Hall Chamber, allowing some Scrutiny committee meetings and Full Council meetings to be webcast. Additional cameras and equipment will be provided in City Hall to allow Cabinet and other committees to be webcast.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Responsible Officer(s)</b>
	All committee agenda, minutes and decision logs to be published in a timely manner	April 2016	Monitoring Officer
	Extend the webcasting of committee meetings to include one scrutiny committee meeting per month	December 2016	Monitoring Officer

#### **P5: Proposal for Improvement**

**Enhance Member accountability by:**

- a** ensuring that the Standards and Ethics Committee plays a more proactive role in promoting and enforcing the Cardiff Undertaking for Councillors and supporting policies in relation to Member conduct and behaviour; and
- b** strengthening member development and learning programmes based on competency assessments to improve skills and understanding to enable them to undertake their roles more effectively; and
- c** determining what training should be considered essential for Members to discharge their role effectively.

The Chair of Standards and Ethics Committee is committed to taking steps to raising proactively the profile of the Cardiff Undertaking for Councillors and to highlighting the importance of appropriate Member conduct and behaviour.

New Hearing Panel Rules will be adopted by the Standards & Ethics Committee for dealing with consideration of complaints made under the Council's Local Resolution Protocol. Training is in place for members of quasi-judicial Public Protection; Licensing and Planning Committees, which members must have attended before they can participate in these committees. Annual refresher training on the Code of Conduct and Information Governance has also been provided.

Democratic Services Officers will review Member training provision and agree a new programme to commence at the start of the new Council term in May 2017 and will also work with the WLGA on the development of new member induction information and training for 2017/18.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Responsible Officer(s)</b>
P5a	Standards & Ethics Committee to publish biannual Member Briefings on the work of the committee, underlining the importance of the Cardiff Undertaking and member conduct and behaviour	August 2016	Monitoring Officer
P5b	Democratic Services Committee to review Member Development & Training and agree new approach and programme to commence in May 2017	December 2016	Monitoring Officer
P5c	Democratic Services Committee to agree essential training and frequency of training prior to start of new council term in May 2017	December 2016	Monitoring Officer

## PERFORMANCE REPORTING

### P6: Proposal for Improvement

Further strengthen performance reporting arrangements to support decision making by:

- a including SMART performance measures within directorate delivery plans, and ensure that these are reported to Cabinet and scrutiny to demonstrate progress;
- b consistently using and reporting on a Red/Amber/Green rating for Corporate Plan commitment actions and Directorate Plan actions in quarterly reports provided to Scrutiny;
- c mandating consistent service level plans; and
- d prioritising key performance indicators (KPIs) where the Council will seek to demonstrate improved performance and outcomes.

The Council accepts the WAO analysis that, despite the additional challenge and rigour introduced, the application of performance management systems remains inconsistent across the Council. This will be reflected in a refresh of the Council's Performance Management Strategy, which will be launched proactively to staff and members.

To further strengthen performance reporting arrangements draft directorate delivery plans will be reviewed and challenged where it is considered that there are not enough SMART performance measures, and steps will be taken to standardise service planning arrangements, with a consistent approach being taken to the use of a balanced scorecard methodology across the Council. The Directorate Delivery Plans should then be considered 'live' documents that the performance management community can work to support throughout the year, meaning further changes can be made as necessary.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Responsible Officer(s)
P6a	All Directorate Delivery Plans to include SMART objectives	April 2016	Head of Performance & Partnerships
P6b	Guidance on how actions should be Red/Amber/Green rated to be communicated to Improvement community	May 2016	Head of Performance & Partnerships
P6c	Service planning framework to be developed focusing on providing a robust and proportionate approach to collating, analysing and using performance information data not captured within Directorate Delivery Plans	October 2016	Head of Performance & Partnerships
P6d	A Balanced Scorecard approach that focuses on those KPIs which best measure the Council's performance and outcomes will be developed and implemented consistently across the Council	June 2016	Head of Performance & Partnerships

## CORPORATE ENABLERS

### P7: Proposal for Improvement

**Adopt a more cohesive and co-ordinated approach to corporate enabler functions to better help the Council drive improvement.**

The Council recognises the need to adopt a more cohesive and co-ordinated approach to corporate enabler functions to better help deliver improved outcomes. This will include a joined up approach to financial and non-financial service performance, including the triangulation of budgetary, contract and cost driver information, with managers understanding the importance of managing this information in a proactive way to ensure services are effective, efficient and on track to meet the Council's strategic objectives. This will require a much greater level of coordination between corporate support services, including the improvement and information governance teams, HR, finance, estates and ICT. Furthermore, the development of the refreshed Performance Management Strategy will not be seen in isolation from the wider needs of the organisation. An integrated approach to the way in which the Council manages performance will be introduced.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Responsible Officer(s)
P7	Refreshed Performance Management Strategy to focus on role of Corporate Enablers and make recommendations for improvement	September 2016	Head of Performance & Partnerships

### P8: Proposal for Improvement

**Further develop the Council's performance management arrangements by:**

- a enhancing the Council's performance management strategy to include guidelines timescales, processes and procedures to support a consistent approach; and
- b increasing the level of performance management and challenge undertaken by the central performance team.

The Performance Management Strategy of the Council will be reviewed and refreshed to ensure clarity around the Council's current process for measuring, reporting and using performance information to drive improvement. In the delivery of the strategy (and before) the Improvement team will be supported to increase the level of challenge to Directorates.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Responsible Officer(s)
	Update the framework element of the Performance Management Strategy to reinforce these areas before further development of the overall strategy	May 2016	Head of Performance & Partnerships
	Review and refresh the Performance Management Strategy	September 2016	Head of Performance & Partnerships

P8b	Improvement team to increase level of performance management and challenge	March 2016 onwards	Head of Performance & Partnerships
-----	--	--------------------	------------------------------------

### **P9: Proposal for Improvement**

**Further develop the Council's Human Resource processes and strategies by:**

- a strengthening the Council's staff appraisal process by including explicitly measurable objectives, capturing information on training on a corporate basis, and developing links to staff's future career aspirations to support workforce and succession planning; and**
- b further embedding the Council's workforce strategy and integrating this with financial and service planning.**

Cabinet agreed the Council's Workforce Strategy during 2015 which integrates workforce planning with financial and service delivery planning. In order to implement this strategy a 3-year Workforce Strategy programme is being taken forward as part of the ODP. This programme is divided into 5 Project areas: Performance Management; Learning and Development; Health and Wellbeing; Employee Voice; and Workforce Planning.

To support the '**Performance Management Project**' guidance around Personal Performance and Development Reviews (PPDRs) will be strengthened with an emphasis on behaviours, as well as the achievement of objectives, with a strong emphasis on managers and supervisors conducting appropriate and supportive conversations with staff on a regular basis. Setting SMART objectives will be a Corporate Objective for all managers 2016/17, and an e-learning module will be developed on SMART Objective setting to support this shift.

Under the '**Learning & Development Project**' the Council 'Academy Board' will oversee prioritises for workforce training corporately, including digital skills and the Cardiff Manager Programme will be extended to all managers at Grade 7 and below.

The '**Workforce Planning Project**' will focus on development of a process for succession planning across the Council, including development of Workforce Planning guidelines and toolkit including a technology based solution; development of profile information for service area use in financial and service planning; skills audit including essential skills; and the development of a strategy for the temporary, casual and agency workforce taking account of social inclusion and youth engagement.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Responsible Officer(s)
P9a	Deliver the Performance Management Project, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development of e-learning module on SMART objective Setting</li> <li>• Setting SMART objectives is to be a Corporate Objective for all managers 2016/17</li> </ul>	March 2017 March 2017	Chief HR Officer
	Deliver Learning & Development Project, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• City of Cardiff Council Academy Board to oversee priorities for workforce training corporately</li> <li>• Cardiff Manager programme extended to all managers Grade 7 and below</li> </ul>	March 2017 March 2017	Chief HR Officer
P9b	Deliver the Workforce Planning Project, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development of process for succession planning across the Council</li> <li>• Development of Workforce Planning guidelines and toolkit including a technology based solution</li> <li>• Develop profile information for service area use in financial and service planning</li> <li>• Develop a strategy for the temporary, casual and agency workforce taking account of social inclusion and youth engagement</li> </ul>	March 2018 January 2017 September 2016 March 2017	Chief HR Officer

#### **P10: Proposal for Improvement**

**Complete the data capture exercise relating to the use of assets and develop a single system to hold appropriate asset management information.**

An internal business case for new Corporate Asset Data Management (CADM) system has been developed including detailed business process mapping. Subject to approval of the business case, a new system will be implemented through the OD team, which could take up to 2 years to fully deliver.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Responsible Officer(s)
	Submit detailed business case to Investment Review Board for final approval	May 2016	Director – Economic Development
	Subject to approval from Investment Review Board, implement the new Corporate Asset Data Management system	May 2018	Director – Economic Development

### **P11: Proposal for Improvement**

**Ensure all outstanding actions from the Construction Excellence Wales review of the Council's building maintenance framework are completed.**

An officer board was set up in May 2015 to take responsibility for monitoring and improving the performance of the building maintenance framework following the Construction Excellence Wales review recommendations. An action plan has been developed and a number of actions have already been completed.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Responsible Officer(s)</b>
P11	Complete all outstanding actions from the Construction Excellence Wales review of the Council's building maintenance framework	March 2017	Corporate Director, Resources

### **P12: Proposal for Improvement**

**Further strengthen the Council's financial planning processes by:**

- a developing more explicit links between the Medium Term Financial Plan and the Council's improvement planning arrangements;**
- b strengthening links between the Medium Term Financial Plan and service plans;**
- c ensuring that savings proposals owned by Directorates are linked to the Organisational Development Programme where relevant, are fully costed, and that delivery is driven by the Organisational Development Programme Board; and**
- d ensuring all budget savings plans are fully developed as appropriate with realistic timescales when the annual budget is set.**

The Council's Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) identifies a budget reduction requirement arising from funding reductions, inflationary and demand pressures. The 2016/17 Budget Report marks an improvement to the Medium Term Planning Process in that it identifies a draft solution to the budget gap for 2017/18 and 2018/19 with a clear direction of travel targeted for 2019/20.

The savings identified as part of this solution were identified as part of an exercise aimed at reshaping the Council's base budget in a way that considered statutory minimum levels of service, the Council's Reshaping Services Programme and Target Operating Model.

The Council's corporate plan, budget and MTFP are developed concurrently, and work is undertaken to ensure their compatibility and consistency. This will be further strengthened.

At a directorate level, as noted above, the Council's approach to identifying a solution for addressing the Medium Term budget gap was based on an exercise that was underpinned by the Council's Target Operating Model. The proposed solution for the medium term should therefore have close synergies with service plans.

Steps have also been taken to ensure that there are clear links between directorates' medium term savings proposals and the Organisation Development Programme's focus on accelerating the shift to online services, facilitating alternative delivery models, increasing revenue from commercial activity and reducing the Council's asset base. Issues arising from both the Organisational Development Programme and the development of budget strategy are considered at Senior Management Team (SMT) on a recurring basis.

In order to ensure that budget savings plans are fully developed with realistic timescales, a series of officer challenge sessions are held following submission of proposals in September. Due diligence considerations are continued throughout the budget setting process. Furthermore, in identifying savings proposals, directorates are required to indicate their planning status, residual and achievability risk along with mitigating actions, and to outline the next steps and key milestones to achieving the saving. They are also asked to outline impacts on capital programme, employee implications and severance costs to give a rounded view of the proposal's implications.

Enhancements have been made to this process as part of 2016/17 budget setting and directorates were requested by Finance to undertake regular review of the planning status of their proposals, with continued emphasis on moving towards a detailed planning stage. Regular updates on the planning status of proposals were supplied into SMT and Informal Cabinet to ensure ongoing momentum. This is evident in the increase in the percentage of budget proposals that were at detailed planning stage at the time of the 2016/17 Budget Report. A total of 90.5% were realised or at detailed planning stage, compared to 82.4% in the 2015/16 budget report.

A further improvement for 2016/17 is the inclusion within the Budget Report of proposals to fully address the Medium Term budget gap for 2017/18 and 2018/19, with a direction of travel set for 2019/20. Post budget setting, this will enable focus to move directly to development and challenge of proposals for 2017/18, with less time and effort during the early part of the year expended on a detailed target-setting exercise. This should enable directorates to move to a detailed planning stage much earlier in the process.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Responsible Officer(s)</b>
P12a	Develop more explicit links between the MTFP and improvement planning arrangements as part of the 2017/18 budget process	December 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P12b	Strengthen the link between the MTFP and service plans as part of 2017/18 budget preparation work	December 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P12c	Review, as part of Budget Strategy, the opportunities to enhance linkages between savings proposals from Directorates and the ODP	July 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P12d	Continue - and build upon - approach adopted for 2016/17 budget	March 2017	Corporate Director, Resources



### **P13: Proposal for Improvement**

**Further strengthen the Council's IT arrangements by:**

- a further developing the draft Digital ICT strategy and formally agreeing this strategic vision for delivering digitally enabled services;**
- b deploying the Customer Relationship Management system fully to appropriate services across the Council;**
- c implementing the mobile scheduling and flexible working technologies where appropriate; and**
- d expanding the number and depth of ICT KPIs measured and reported, to cover the whole ICT service, and benchmark against public service comparators.**

The Council has made significant advances in shifting towards a 'digital first' model, and the Digital Strategy 2016-21 is due to be considered by the Cabinet on 19 May 2016. Mobile & Scheduling deployment to Care Workers is already live and flexible working technologies for Social Workers will soon be rolled out. Phase 1 of CRM is live in the contact centre with portal elements to be completed by April 2016.

Following a CIPFA benchmarking exercise on ICT KPIs an all-Wales SOCITM benchmarking package will commence in the new financial year, with a focus on reviewing ICT cost and quality performance over the previous year. Commencing in April 2016, a number of benchmarking exercises will be conducted through the course of the financial year.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Responsible Officer(s)</b>
P13a	Digital Strategy 2016-21 to be considered by Cabinet	May 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P13b	Initiate project to deliver phase 2 of the CRM	June 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P13c	Roll out flexible working across the council for those workers who would benefit from delivering their services in a range of locations	December 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P13d	Review the ICT additional performance reporting requirements and establish a revised basket of KPIs	March 2017	Corporate Director, Resources

## **P14: Proposal for Improvement**

**Further strengthen the Council's information governance arrangements by:**

- a** completing the outstanding actions from the Information Commissioner's Office audit on data protection and information confidentiality;
- b** increasing the level of staff completion of the Council's information confidentiality and data protection e-learning training programme;
- c** fully implementing the Electronic Records Management System across the Council;
- d** improving the Council's response rates against statutory targets in respect of data protection subject access requests and Freedom of Information Act requests; and
- e** completing a Caldicott principles into practice self-assessment.

An Action Plan in response to previous Improvement Commissioner's Office audit is in place and progress is monitored by the Information Security Board on a quarterly basis.

An Electronic Document and Records Management System (ERDMS) has been established and a project is in place for delivery with 8 service areas.

Compliance with statutory timescales in respect of requests for information under the Subject Access provisions of the Data Protection Act (SARs) and Freedom of Information (FOI) requests has improved to 86%. A streamlined process and case management system has been introduced. Compliance where this is used is 89%, compared to 67% where it is not used. Compliance reports are presented as part of the Council's Quarterly Performance & Delivery Reports and to the Information Security Board.

<b>Ref</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Timescale</b>	<b>Responsible Officer(s)</b>
P14a	Continue to implement the Action Plan following most recent audit by the Information Commissioner's Office	March 2017	Corporate Director, Resources
P14b	Implement new Information Governance e-learning training programme	May 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P14c	Rollout EDRMS to remaining users (circa 4000)	April 2017	Corporate Director, Resources
P14d	Seek approval to bring all SARs and FOI requests within the corporate responsibility of the Improvement and Information Team	September 2016	Corporate Director, Resources
P14e	Undertake a review of existing information governance monitoring arrangements to provide assurance that they appropriately reflect Caldicott principles	March 2017	Corporate Director, Resources

# Wales Audit Office Corporate Assessment Follow On Report – Statement of Action

## Progress Report July 2017

### RECOMMENDATION

*R1: The Council must ensure that it addresses the proposals for improvement as set out in this report to deliver improved outcomes within the next 12 months*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
R1	Undertake a review of the Council's Organisational Development Programme (ODP)	Jun-16	Chief Executive	<p><b>Completed.</b> A review of the ODP was undertaken in April-May 2016. This work led to the re-shaping of the ODP for 2016-17, specifically some refining of the Commercialisation Programme and the introduction of the Performance &amp; Governance Programme. A report of this review was taken to the Policy Review and Performance (PRAP) Scrutiny Committee and to Cabinet in June 2016.</p> <p>An independent review of the ODP was undertaken in April 2017 as the ODP reached the end of its 3-year programme. The findings and recommendations of this review are being used to inform the development of a new change programme, which will be considered by Cabinet in October 2017.</p>

Page 17

## PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVEMENT: Leadership & Management

*P1: Develop further engagement opportunities with staff and Members to consistently embed a constructive performance management culture across the organisation to help deliver improved outcomes.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P1	Review and refresh of the Council's programme of staff engagement	Apr-16	Chief Executive	<p><b>Completed.</b> The staff engagement programme was reviewed and refreshed in Q1 2016-17 with an enhanced programme implemented in 2016-17. The results of the Council's Staff Survey show a notable increase between 2015 and 2017 of respondents who agree that 'communication/staff engagement has improved over the last 12 months.'</p> <p>Staff engagement activity in 2017-18 is based on an action plan that has been developed to build on this progress.</p>
P1	Development of a new programme for member communications and engagement	<p>Jun-16 (original)</p> <p>May-17 (revised)</p>	Chief Executive	<p><b>Completed.</b> Member communication and engagement was reviewed and refreshed following the Member Communication Survey, entitled 'Let's Talk About It', and an action plan was developed on the basis of the survey results.</p> <p>Changes made include the issuing of weekly updates for Members including details of committee meetings, member training sessions and other events. An online platform to deliver regular policy updates is also being piloted.</p>

## PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVEMENT: Governance

*P2: Clarify the roles and responsibilities within the Council's decision making framework. In particular:*

- a. ensuring that meetings of the Informal Cabinet meetings are recorded appropriately;*
- b. ensuring that the title and roles of Assistants to Cabinet Members' are applied consistently ensuring that their limited roles and responsibilities do not cloud any accountabilities;*
- c. review the role and membership of Cabinet Advisory Groups to ensure that those members involved do not sit on any Scrutiny Committee responsible for scrutinising the same/similar issues; and*
- d. ensure that a decision is made on the issue about whether to delegate executive decision-making to individual Cabinet Members.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P2a	Key action points from informal meeting of the Cabinet will be recorded by the Cabinet Office	May-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b> A guidance note was provided by the Interim Monitoring Officer to the Cabinet Office in April 2016. This was also circulated to Cabinet Members for information in May 2016. Actions are captured by Cabinet Support Officers from all informal Cabinet meetings (now known as Cabinet briefings).
P2b	Role description for Assistants to Cabinet Members will be included within the Council's Constitution and provided to all post-holders to assist in clarifying roles and responsibilities	Jul-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b> Following approval by the Constitution Committee the Assistant to Cabinet Member role description was agreed as an amendment to the constitution by Full Council on Thursday 20th October 2016. Cabinet appointed 4 new Assistants to Cabinet Members (Cabinet Assistants) in June 2017 and the role profiles have been provided to all post-holders.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P2c	Terms of Reference for Cabinet Advisory Groups will be agreed	Jul-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b> The Terms of Reference for Cabinet Advisory Groups were agreed by Cabinet on 19th May 2016.
P2d	Constitution Committee to undertake a further review of the volume and category of decisions taken by the Cabinet over the last 12 months and consider making provision within the Council's constitution for executive decision-making to be delegated to individual Cabinet Members	Sep-16	Monitoring Officer	<p><b>Completed.</b> A report on the volume and category of decisions taken by Cabinet was considered by Constitution Committee on 21st September, thus completing the review.</p> <p>It was agreed that this issue should be considered at the start of the next administration in May 2017. As such, delegation of executive decision-making has been discussed with Cabinet Members as part of their Induction. Further comparative analysis has been requested before they consider asking Constitution Committee to look at putting this in place.</p>

DRAFT

*P3: Further strengthen the Council's scrutiny function by:*

- a. developing an approach to scrutinising cross cutting issues; and*
- b. ensuring that any vacancies on scrutiny committees are filled quickly.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P3a	Implementation of the recommendations of the Improving Scrutiny Report	May-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b> Remaining outstanding actions from the Improving Scrutiny Report were incorporated into the Review of Scrutiny project (see below).

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P3a	Review of Scrutiny to be undertaken with recommendations to be implemented from the start of the next political term	Dec-16 (original)  May-17 (full completion)	Monitoring Officer	<p><b>Completed.</b> The Review of Scrutiny Project was formed as part of the ODP in April 2016 and has included the following range of activity:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A self-evaluation exercise by scrutiny chairs</li> <li>• A dip sample of five scrutiny items</li> <li>• Stakeholder engagement</li> <li>• Annual Member Survey</li> <li>• Members' Seminar</li> </ul> <p>A report setting out the outcomes from the review was considered by Constitution Committee on 2 March 2017. The Committee made recommendations to be considered by the next Council after the election in May on the future structure of Scrutiny within the Council.</p> <p>The review was considered by Annual Council on 25 May 2017. Two of the recommendations were accepted (to increase committee numbers back to nine, and to encourage non-Executive Members to participate in scrutiny). The recommendation to reduce the number of committees from five to four was deferred for 12 months.</p> <p>A closure report was completed for this project in May 2017.</p>
P3b	Appointments to vacancies on scrutiny committees to be considered as a standing item on all council meeting agendas	May-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b>



Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P3b	Examine reasons why vacancies exist on scrutiny committees as part of the Annual Member Survey	May-16	Monitoring Officer	<p><b>Completed.</b> Results from the Annual Member Survey identified a range of challenges perceived by Members about participating in scrutiny. An options paper was subsequently prepared and discussed with associated Members and officers during June and July 2016.</p> <p>Full Council decided temporarily (until May 2017) to reduce the number of Members sitting on Scrutiny Committees to 8. By September 2016, there were 3 elected Member vacancies.</p> <p>On 25 May 2017 Council increased the number of Committee Members back to 9.</p>

*P4: Ensure that all committee agendas, minutes and decision-logs are published in a timely manner on the Council's website, and increase the number of committees that are webcast.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P4	All scrutiny committee agenda, minutes and decision logs to be published in a timely manner	Apr-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b> Continued monitoring of performance by Democratic Services is being undertaken on a quarterly basis.
P4	Extend the webcasting of committee meetings to include one scrutiny meeting per month	Dec-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b> Webcasts now include one Scrutiny committee meeting each month; the first live webcast was the Economy & Culture Scrutiny Committee in December 2016.

*P5: Enhance Member accountability by:*

- a. ensuring that the Standards and Ethics Committee plays a more proactive role in promoting and enforcing the Cardiff Undertaking for Councillors and supporting policies in relation to Member conduct and behaviour; and*
- b. strengthening member development and learning programmes based on competency assessments to improve skills and understanding to enable them to undertake their roles more effectively; and*
- c. determining what training should be considered essential for Members to discharge their role effectively.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P5a	Standards & Ethics Committee to publish biannual Member Briefings on the work of the Committee underlining the importance of the Cardiff Undertaking and member conduct and behaviour	Aug-16	Monitoring Officer	<b>Completed.</b> The first Member Briefing was issued in August 2016. A programme of further Member Briefings are scheduled for the new Council, beginning in September.

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P5b	Democratic Services Committee to review Member Development & Training and to agree new approach and programme to commence in May 2017	Dec-16 (original) Mar-17 (revised)	Monitoring Officer	<p><b>Completed.</b> The Council's 2015-16 Member Development Programme was reviewed by the Democratic Services Committee's task and finish group in July 2016.</p> <p>A proposed Member Induction Programme to be implemented from May 2017 was considered by Democratic Services Committee and discussed by SMT in December 2016. A questionnaire to all members seeking feedback on issues including induction and training questions was then carried out in early 2017, and the results used to inform the final Member Induction Programme which was approved in principle by Democratic Services Committee on 1 March 2017.</p> <p>A member training needs analysis will be undertaken in September to inform an ongoing member training programme.</p> <p>All political groups have also been asked to put forward nominations to attend the WLGA Leadership Programme for elected members.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P5c	Democratic Services Committee to agree essential training and frequency of training prior to start of new council term in May 2017	Dec-16 (original) Mar-17 (revised)	Monitoring Officer	<p><b>Completed.</b> The finalised Induction Programme was approved in principle by Democratic Services Committee on 1 March 2017. This included Essential training.</p> <p>Constitution Committee recommended to full Council that training relating to topics with legal implications should become obligatory and that this should be reflected in the Cardiff Undertaking and terms of reference of committees.</p> <p>Full Council in March 2017 agreed to amend the Cardiff Undertaking to set out agreement from each individual member that they will carry out essential training and to amend the Terms of Reference of quasi-judicial Committees in the Council's Constitution to make clear that members of the Committees must have attended the relevant training.</p> <p>A programme of essential training has taken place in the first 12 weeks of the new Council, including:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Code of Conduct</li> <li>- Information Governance</li> <li>- Equalities</li> <li>- Local Government Finance</li> <li>- Council procedural rules</li> <li>- Regulatory specific committee training</li> </ul>

## PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVEMENT: Performance Reporting

*P6: Further strengthen performance reporting arrangements to support decision making by:*

- a. including SMART performance measures within directorate delivery plans, and ensure that these are reported to Cabinet and scrutiny to demonstrate progress;*
- b. consistently using and reporting on a Red/Amber/Green rating for Corporate Plan commitment actions and Directorate Plan actions in quarterly reports provided to Scrutiny;*
- c. mandating consistent service level plans; and*
- d. prioritising key performance indicators (KPIs) where the Council will seek to demonstrate improved performance and outcomes.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P6a	All Directorate Delivery Plans to include SMART objectives	Apr-16	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<p><b>Completed.</b> All Directorate Delivery Plans now include SMART objectives.</p> <p>The Council's Corporate Performance Team worked with Directorates' performance management leads to undertake a peer review of 2016-17 Directorate Delivery Plans to ensure the inclusion of SMART objectives. This process was further refined through the Business Planning project for the 2017-18 Directorate Delivery Planning process.</p>
P6b	Guidance on how actions should be Red/Amber/Green rated to be communicated to Improvement community	May-16	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<p><b>Completed.</b> A consistent approach to RAG-rating activities set out in Directorate Delivery Plans has now been developed and implemented, building on the Council's existing Risk Management matrix.</p> <p>An automated approach has been developed to RAG-rating the outturns for numerical performance indicators, using formulae that automatically classify outturn results on the basis of corporately-set tolerance levels.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P6c	Service planning framework to be developed focusing on providing a robust and proportionate approach to collating, analysing and using performance information data not captured within Directorate Delivery Plans	Oct-16 (original)  Mar/ Apr-17 (revised)	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<p><b>Completed.</b> A framework has been put in place.</p> <p>The key features of this are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- All service areas (specifically those that report into a Director) have created a Service Plan to show their priorities, objectives and activity for 2017/18 and how they will measure and show progress towards delivery</li> <li>- The information in the plans is at service level and shows how the service contributes to the achievement of the relevant Directorate Delivery Plan</li> <li>- The content of the plans reflects what is important to the service and what it must deliver and achieve</li> <li>- Services have some flexibility over the exact format they adopted to enhance usability, provided certain principles are adhered to. However, best practice examples were provided and widely followed</li> <li>- This information gives a clear and structured set of information at service level</li> </ul> <p>This framework is designed to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Enable early warning and enable early intervention</li> <li>- Provide a service-level perspective of corporate issues</li> <li>- Support analysis of service level issues through ensuring consistency of the style, structure, and content`</li> </ul>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P6d	A Balanced Scorecard approach that focuses on those KPIs which best measure the Council's performance and outcomes will be developed and implemented consistently across the Council	Jun-16 (original) April-17 (revised)	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<b>Completed.</b> Performance is now reported at corporate, directorate and service levels using a balanced scorecard approach, utilising focused sets of Performance Indicators.

DRAFT



## PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVEMENT: Corporate Enablers

*P7: Adopt a more cohesive and co-ordinated approach to corporate enabler functions to better help the Council drive improvement.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P7	Refreshed Performance Management Strategy to focus on role of Corporate Enablers and make recommendations for improvement	Sep-16 (original)  May-17 (revised)	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<p><b>Completed.</b> The Performance Management Strategy (PMS) has been refreshed and is being communicated to key stakeholders (e.g. Cabinet member, Performance Support Group (PSG), SMT). The refreshed PMS will add value by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Improving corporate enablers by ensuring the Council's practices, processes and requirements support effective service delivery and improvement across the Council.</li> <li>- Improving the consistency and clarity between corporate enablers by ensuring the approaches of enabling functions (e.g. HR, finance, and performance management) are consistent with each other and are communicated to staff in a way that clearly sets out how they can and should fit together into a coherent framework.</li> </ul> <p>Additionally, the Performance Support Group has now been established and this provides the key mechanism for bringing together senior representatives from the Council's enabling and front-facing services to ensure the most effective use of the Council's resources and the continued emphasis on service and performance improvement.</p>

*P8: Further develop the Council's performance management arrangements by:*

- a. enhancing the Council's performance management strategy to include guidelines timescales, processes and procedures to support a consistent approach; and*
- b. increasing the level of performance management and challenge undertaken by the central performance team.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P8a	Update the framework element of the Performance Management Strategy to reinforce these areas before further development of the overall strategy	May-16 (business as usual basis)  May 2017 (complete version)	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<b>Completed.</b> The Performance Management Strategy and Framework have been refreshed, with guidelines provided to ensure a consistent approach. The Performance Management Framework sets out the key elements that will allow anyone in the organisation to understand how their role relates to the overall Performance Management Strategy, and will give them the tools they need to manage service performance effectively.
P8a	Review and refresh the Performance Management Strategy	Sep-16 (original)  May-17 (revised)	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<b>Completed.</b> The Performance Management Strategy has been reviewed and refreshed, and a roll-out is currently underway. The Performance Management Strategy is the overarching statement of the way Performance Management is approached within the Council and how this approach will support the Council to achieve its priorities.
P8b	Improvement team to increase level of performance management and challenge	Mar-16 ongoing	Head of Performance & Partnerships	<b>Completed.</b> The Performance Support Group (PSG) was established in early 2016-17 in direct response to the recommendations in the Follow On Report. The PSG brings together senior representatives from the Council's key enabling functions and front-facing services to ensure the most effective use of the Council's resources and the continued emphasis on service and performance improvement. The Corporate Performance Team links into the PSG by undertaking analysis of performance data to

Page 32

				inform the group's agenda, and supports the ongoing work to follow up performance issues.
--	--	--	--	---

DRAFT

*P9: Further develop the Council's Human Resource processes and strategies by:*

- a. strengthening the Council's staff appraisal process by including explicitly measurable objectives, capturing information on training on a corporate basis, and developing links to staff's future career aspirations to support workforce and succession planning; and*
- b. further embedding the Council's workforce strategy and integrating this with financial and service planning.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P9a	Deliver the Performance Management Project.	Mar-17	Chief HR Officer	<p><b>Completed.</b> The Personal Performance &amp; Development Review (PPDR) scheme was reviewed in Quarter 1 2016. An inclusive approach was taken, with a series of engagement events held with staff from across the Council leading to a series of recommendations for change. The draft template and principles were subsequently considered by Cabinet, Senior Management Team and the Trade Unions.</p> <p>The new PPDR process has been applied across the Council from 1<sup>st</sup> April 2017, with HR systems updated and training modules, guides and a promotional campaign produced to support the change.</p>
P9a	Deliver the Performance Management Project including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Development of e-learning module on SMART objective setting</li> </ul>	Mar-17	Chief HR Officer	<p><b>Completed.</b> An E-learning module has been developed and is available to support managers in setting SMART objectives. The existing PPDR e-learning modules have also been re-designed to include more detail on SMART objectives.</p>

Page 34

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P9a	Deliver the Performance Management Project including:  2. Setting SMART objectives is to be a Corporate Objective for all managers 2016/17	Mar-17	Chief HR Officer	<b>Completed.</b>
P9a	Delivering Learning & Development Project including:  1. City of Cardiff Council Academy Board to oversee priorities for workforce training corporately	Mar-17	Chief HR Officer	<b>Completed.</b> The Academy Board, which meets quarterly, is now responsible for overseeing priorities for workforce training corporately.
P9a	Delivering Learning & Development Project including:  2. Cardiff Manager Programme extended to all managers Grade 7 and below	Mar-17	Chief HR Officer	<b>Completed.</b> The Cardiff Manager Programme was extended to all managers Grade 7 and below from 4th May 2016. The programme is scheduled for completion on 31 March 2018, with a target of 338 managers at Grade 7 or below completing the training. As of July 2017, 209 have completed or are participating on CMP. Reminder messages will be sent to the Managers of those who have not yet signed up so that this can be raised during the Half Year Review Process.
P9b	Deliver the Workforce Planning Project including:  1. Development of process for succession planning across the Council	Mar-18	Chief HR Officer	<b>Ongoing.</b> A succession planning process is under development, and will advance from the Workforce Planning toolkit which is also being developed (see below).

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P9b	Deliver the Workforce Planning Project including:  2. Development of Workforce Planning guidelines and toolkit including a technology-based solution	Jan-17 (original)  Mar-18 (to deliver technology-based solution)	Chief HR Officer	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> A review of best practice was undertaken and a draft toolkit was produced in September 2016. Following feedback from Directorates' representatives, the toolkit was consulted on with SMT and the trade unions during January 2017. It was agreed that 3 service areas will pilot the toolkit for the 2017/18 business planning process, commencing in May 2017. Following the pilots the toolkit will be refined as necessary with full roll-out taking place in 18/19.</p> <p>The technology-based solution has been delayed for 12 months to ensure that it meets the requirements demonstrated by the pilot process.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P9b	<p>Deliver the Workforce Planning Project including:</p> <p>3. Develop profile information for service area use in financial and service planning</p>	<p>Sep-16 (original)</p> <p>Feb-17 (revised)</p>	Chief HR Officer	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> Review of information provided for 2016/17 is underway, including the identification of additional profile information and an assessment of what can be delivered from current systems and what would be required in the future. This work is being undertaken in liaison with Business Planning project to strengthen the link between workforce planning and service planning.</p> <p>Profile information will be available for the 2017/18 business planning process by way of a dashboard approach and details will be provided to Directorates of how relevant information can be retrieved from HR systems for future years.</p>
P9b	<p>Deliver the Workforce Planning Project including:</p> <p>4. Develop a strategy for the temporary, casual and agency workforce taking account of social inclusion and youth engagement</p>	Mar-17	Chief HR Officer	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> The Council has strengthened its commitment to providing opportunities for social inclusion and youth engagement.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- 20% of all new recruits into Council roles in the last 12 months have been in the age bracket 16-24.</li> <li>- Approx. 60 14-16 year olds are on a junior apprenticeship with Cardiff &amp; Vale College which has been set up in conjunction with the Council's Education department, and the Council will be looking to provide work experience opportunities to a number of these young people.</li> </ul>

Page 37

*P10: Complete the data capture exercise relating to the use of assets and develop a single system to hold appropriate asset management information.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P10	Submit detailed business case to Investment Review Board for final approval	May-16 (original)  Sep-17	Director Economic Development	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> The Real Estate IT outline business case was submitted to Investment Review Board (IRB) in November 2016. IRB approved work to determine a detailed requirements specification in preparation for tender in 2017. A review of Council property management in early 2017 broadened the scope of the project and aligned Real Estate IT with Facilities Management IT requirements within the new Corporate Landlord Programme.</p> <p>The Real Estate IT software project is now progressing within the Corporate Landlord programme as part of the Asset Management Principles stream. A full business case is being drafted, including the requirements of FM, and is currently planned to be presented to Investment Review Board in September 2017.</p>
P10	Subject to approval from Investment Review Board, implement the new Corporate Asset Management system	May-18	Director Economic Development	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> This will be completed in line with the actions above.</p>

Page 38



*P11: Ensure all outstanding actions from the Construction Excellence Wales review of the Council's building maintenance framework are completed.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P11	Complete all outstanding actions from the Construction Excellence Wales (CEW) review of the Council's building maintenance framework	Mar-17	Corporate Director, Resources	<b>Ongoing.</b> The Building Maintenance Performance board chaired by the Assistant Director of Communities oversees the actions that were recommended by CEW. The two outstanding actions from in February 2016 (when the Follow On Report was issued), relating to the Council's Statutory Maintenance Programme and the creation of a Council-wide Community Benefits Board, have been completed.

*P12: Further strengthen the Council's financial planning processes by:*

- a. developing more explicit links between the Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) and the Council's improvement planning arrangements;*
- b. strengthening links between the Medium Term Financial Plan and service plans;*
- c. ensuring that savings proposals owned by Directorates are linked to the Organisational Development Programme where relevant, are fully costed, and that delivery is driven by the Organisational Development Programme Board; and*
- d. ensuring all budget savings plans are fully developed as appropriate with realistic timescales when the annual budget is set.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P12a	Develop more explicit links between the MTFP and improvement planning arrangements as part of the 2017/18 budget process	Dec-16	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> Stronger links were made between the MTFP and the Council's Corporate Plan and directorate service plans over the course of 2016/17. The two-way interaction between the development of the MTFP and improvement planning arrangements was scoped out during meetings between senior managers. Work was undertaken to identify and establish links with the Corporate Plan in respect of both revenue and capital budgets including the impact of recent legislation such as the Well-being of Future Generations Act.</p> <p>In June 2017 the Council's Cabinet approved 'Capital Ambition,' a policy programme for the new Administration. Work is currently underway to translate these policy ambitions into costed and deliverable SMART objectives, as the basis for a new Corporate Plan, with clear links to the Council's budget strategy and change programme.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P12b	Strengthen the link between the MTFP and service plans as part of the 2017/18 budget preparation work	Dec-16	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> As above, enhanced links were put in place between the MTFP and service plans as part of the 2017/18 budget preparation.</p> <p>Furthermore, continual review of the MTFP ensures cross-reference to current and future service plans:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The half-year position of the Corporate Risk Register was considered by both the Cabinet and Audit Committee, and the results were tested against the MTFP.</li> <li>• A workshop for SMT was held in early October 2016 on the Well-being of Future Generations Act – the results of that were scoped out and then tested back to consider the impact on service delivery plans.</li> <li>• Directorate budget proposals for 2017-18 which were submitted for consultation have been preliminarily considered together in respect of the Well-being Act and will be continually reviewed at points in time to maintain that strategic link and focus.</li> </ul> <p>In addition a specific piece of work was undertaken in partnership with the Social Services Directorate in order to further refine the links between their service plan and the MTFP by identifying the range of cost/ saving impact of each intervention.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P12c	Review, as part of Budget Strategy, the opportunities to enhance linkages between savings proposals from Directorates and the Organisational Development Programme	Jul-16 (original)  May-17 (revised)	Corporate Director, Resources	<b>Ongoing.</b> Any business cases put forward for budget savings in 2016-17 were already supported by the OD team. These were then recorded within the ODP to highlight the impact of the change, but it remained the individual directorate's responsibility to achieve the agreed savings.

DRAFT

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P12d	Continue - and build upon - approach adopted for 2016/17 budget	Mar-17	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> The 2017-18 budget process commenced in May 2016 with directorates providing detailed savings plans.</p> <p>Saving proposals were shared with the OD team to ensure that early sight enabled early engagement with Directorates in delivering budget proposals in a full and prompt manner.</p> <p>The plans were reviewed regularly for detail and achievability, and were discussed at a joint SMT/Cabinet Meeting in July 2016, resulting in further work to either refine proposals or identify alternative ones.</p> <p>The Budget Strategy 2017-18 was then approved by Cabinet in July 2016. Between July and October 2016 directorate budget savings proposals for 2017-18 were continually reviewed for both suitability and diligence. Regular updates were shared at Directorate, SMT and Cabinet level.</p> <p>The Provisional Settlement was received as anticipated on 19<sup>th</sup> October 2016 and the Budget Strategy was then revised accordingly with the new set of assumptions. The report containing draft budget proposals for 2017-18 for consultation was then considered and approved by Cabinet on 10<sup>th</sup> November 2016. Public consultation commenced the following day, and received over 2500 responses.</p>

*P13: Further strengthen the Council's IT arrangements by:*

- a. further developing the draft Digital ICT strategy and formally agreeing this strategic vision for delivering digitally enabled services;*
- b. deploying the Customer Relationship Management system fully to appropriate services across the Council;*
- c. implementing the mobile scheduling and flexible working technologies where appropriate; and*
- d. expanding the number and depth of ICT KPIs measured and reported, to cover the whole ICT service, and benchmark against public service comparators.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P13a	Digital Strategy 2016-21 to be considered by Cabinet	May-16	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Completed.</b> A Digital Strategy was approved by Cabinet on 19th May 2016. The implementation of the Strategy is ongoing across the Council, both through the OD Programme and service activity.</p> <p>The Council has recently engaged Capgemini to identify future opportunities for digitisation, beginning with a two-day workshop for 60 senior managers (including SMT) in September 2017.</p>
P13b	Initiate project to deliver phase 2 of the CRM	Jun-16 (original) Apr-17 (revised)	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> Due to technical issues roll-out of the CRM has not met its original timescales. The supplier for CRM, SAP, has escalated the Council's concerns to global level in order to seek a resolution to this issue, resulting in senior representatives from across SAP's worldwide structure working directly with the Council. In response SAP are currently developing a proposal that will set out an implementation plan. A meeting is scheduled for August 2017 to discuss and seek to agree a way forward.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P13c	Roll out flexible working across the Council for those workers who would benefit from delivering their services in a range of locations	Dec-16	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> Around 1,750 staff currently have remote access to the corporate network, many of whom work as home workers, work flexibly at home or work out of the office on an ad-hoc basis. These staff traditionally use PCs, laptops or tablets to access Council systems. 280 staff use customised mobile applications to work directly from site rather than visiting offices. This includes care workers and community maintenance teams. In addition to this 2,100 users have remote access to email to allow them to access their messages from wherever they are.</p> <p>In 2016/17 over 700 social care staff have received laptops/ tablets &amp; new smartphones to mobilise their working practices and allow them to work in a more flexible and efficient manner. To further support mobile working 40 touchdown points have been created across the city where staff can call in to charge their devices, access public Wi-Fi, use meeting rooms, have quiet places to work or just pick up print-outs.</p> <p>The Council now encourages any service buying new or replacement equipment to actively consider buying equipment suitable for use in a mobile/ agile manner with an emphasis on buying laptop and tablets rather than the traditional desktop devices. The mobile and flexible working models have been made 'business as usual'.</p> <p>Further business cases are now being developed to underpin future phases of these various models of flexible working.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P13d	Review the ICT additional performance reporting requirements and establish a revised basket of KPIs	Mar-17	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Completed.</b> Work is underway with SOCITM Wales and the Welsh Unitary Authority ICT leads to discuss a common approach to KPIs across Wales but also with reference to wider SOCITM member KPIs within English authorities.</p> <p>Cardiff led on the procurement of an all-Wales SOCITM benchmarking exercise which benchmarked aspects such as digital maturity, IT maturity, IT performance and IT cost effectiveness and has used the outcomes of these benchmarks to inform potential future KPIs. As a result of this review Cardiff ICT now publish KPIs for the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Reliability of the top 10 core applications</li> <li>• Customer satisfaction with the ICT service</li> <li>• Availability of desktop services</li> <li>• Availability of corporate Multi-Function Devices (print/scan/copiers)</li> <li>• Core network and telephony availability</li> <li>• Percentage of devices in use that support mobility and agile working.</li> </ul> <p>The all-Wales digital benchmarking commissioned by Welsh Government to review Welsh Local Authorities' digital maturity has also been procured from SOCITM. Cardiff completed their benchmarking interview on the 6th Jan 2017 and the resulting Welsh Government report has been published this month (11th April 2017).</p>



*P14: Further strengthen the Council's information governance arrangements by:*

- a. completing the outstanding actions from the Information Commissioner's Office audit on data protection and information confidentiality;*
- b. increasing the level of staff completion of the Council's information confidentiality and data protection e-learning training programme;*
- c. fully implementing the Electronic Records Management System across the Council;*
- d. improving the Council's response rates against statutory targets in respect of data protection subject access requests and Freedom of Information Act requests; and*
- e. completing a Caldicott principles into practice self-assessment.*

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P14a	Continue to implement the Action Plan following most recent audit by the Information Commissioner's Office	May 2018 (Revised)	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> The Information Commissioner's Office action plan is being implemented. The following three actions are <b>completed</b>:</p> <p><b>1. Building Security:</b> Action C27 is the action related to undertaking a risk assessment of security at County Hall has been completed within the timescale. This was supplemented by a further review of County Hall by the Corporate Security Manager. This included promoting a proactive security culture through the wearing of security identification as well as control of visitors, contractors and members of the public who visit the building. Good progress has been made, for examples segregating pedestrian access areas as part of the car park revisions, upgrading the car park lighting to LED in the first three bays, installing new software (Kalamazoo reader) to monitor visitors to County Hall and establishing revisions to the hours staff use the side entrance. A review of CCTV coverage and ID access cards has also been completed and a project plan has been developed.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
				<p><b>2. ICT Security Officer training to be reviewed by OM IT Services:</b> This was reviewed and ICT forensic investigation training was completed by the ICT Security &amp; Investigations Officer as a result.</p> <p><b>3. Removal media risk assessment and mitigation:</b> This action has been closed as it is considered that the Council has in place effective risk mitigation through the use of enforced encryption.</p>

DRAFT

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
				<p>Two actions remain <b>ongoing</b> in relation to the Action Plan established as a result of the Consensual Audit by the Information Commissioner's Office.</p> <p><b>1. Starters, Leavers &amp; Movers (SLAM) process is being revised:</b> Two of the actions in the Action Plan (C28 &amp; C39) have been merged as the action required to deal with the recommendations is related to SLAM.</p> <p>Work is almost complete on joining the datasets between our three key personnel systems to ensure the process of dealing with starters and leavers is more efficiently managed. This process will remove any ambiguity of leavers' details between these systems allowing more timely disabling and deletion of accounts. This integration will ensure data in all three systems is then updated in sync. This improved data integration will allow speedier set-up of users and also more timely removal. A report was presented to SMT in July 2017 to obtain their agreement on more timely removal of email and system accounts of staff leaving the organisation. Meetings are also taking place to understand how we can more quickly setup accounts for staff joining at short notice such as agency workers.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
				<p><b>Protective Marking</b></p> <p>A number of changes have been made as part of the requirements of classification of marking documents since the Information Commissioners' audit of the Council. During this time the Council has investigated options and software providers which could be implemented.</p> <p>ICT/IM and EA are considering the ability of protective marking as part of the implementation of Office 365. These discussions are ongoing and options will be presented to the SIRO.</p> <p>It is however important to note that the Council is also reviewing the requirements of the General Data Protection Regulation and E-Privacy Directive which is due to be introduced as this is likely to impact on any marking schemes to be adopted. The Council will therefore continue to investigate options and consider these in line with legislative changes before making and final recommendations for adopting any marking schemes.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P14b	Implement new Information Governance e-learning training programme	May-16	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Completed.</b> The e-learning package has been delivered, with 73% of staff having completed the training in 2016.</p> <p>Work is ongoing with HR to ensure that the starters and leavers process is more efficient which will enable improved roll out.</p>
P14c	Rollout EDRMS to remaining users (circa 4,000)	Apr-17	Corporate Director, Resources	<p><b>Ongoing.</b> All staff now have access to SharePoint and can access documents within it. However, a current evaluation of implementation progress has shown that whilst take-up of SharePoint has improved (currently 22 live sites and 27 in development), a further 89 sites are yet to be deployed.</p> <p>To accelerate deployment a training officer post has been approved and will be advertised in July 2017.</p> <p>In June 2017 SMT considered progress against the original timeline and agreed further support and engagement to ensure achievement of a revised implementation plan. Consequentially, the Investment Review Board approved the creation of 4 new posts to drive implementation across the Council, subject to a new implementation plan being drawn up, based on prioritisation of need and highlighting potential efficiency savings. This plan will be submitted to IRB in October 2017.</p>

Ref	Action	Timescale	Lead Officer	Progress
P14d	Seek approval to bring all SARs and FOI requests within the corporate responsibility of the Improvement and Information Team	Sep-16 (original)  September 2017 (delivery)	Corporate Director, Resources	<b>Completed.</b> Approval has been given to bring all SARs and FOI requests within the corporate responsibility of the Improvement Governance Team. The recruitment phase has concluded for the additional posts budgeted for in order to transfer work from Social Services and awaiting new appointees to start work. This is scheduled to be in Quarter 2 2017-18.
P14e	Undertake a review of existing information governance monitoring arrangements to provide assurance that they appropriately reflect Caldicott principles	Mar-17	Corporate Director, Resources	<b>Completed.</b> The NHS CPIP assessment questions were completed in May 2016 by the Corporate Information Governance Team and the Director of Social Services. The Assessment and Action Plan was completed and shared with the Information Security Board in September. Please note the full NHS assessment process is currently not available for use; further enquiries are underway with NWIS.

Page 52

DRAFT



WALES AUDIT OFFICE  
SWYDDFA ARCHWILIO CYMRU

Archwilydd Cyffredinol Cymru  
Auditor General for Wales

# Can the Council demonstrate sufficient progress in meeting proposals for improvement made in February 2016? – **City of Cardiff Council**

Audit year: 2016-17

Date issued: September 2017

Document reference: 130A2017-18

This document has been prepared as part of work performed in accordance with statutory functions.

In the event of receiving a request for information to which this document may be relevant, attention is drawn to the Code of Practice issued under section 45 of the Freedom of Information Act 2000.

The section 45 code sets out the practice in the handling of requests that is expected of public authorities, including consultation with relevant third parties. In relation to this document, the Auditor General for Wales and the Wales Audit Office are relevant third parties. Any enquiries regarding

disclosure or re-use of this document should be sent to the Wales Audit Office at

[infoofficer@audit.wales](mailto:infoofficer@audit.wales).

We welcome correspondence and telephone calls in Welsh and English. Corresponding in Welsh will not lead to delay. Rydym yn croesawu gohebiaeth a galwadau ffôn yn Gymraeg a Saesneg. Ni fydd gohebu yn Gymraeg yn arwain at oedi.

Mae'r ddogfen hon hefyd ar gael yn Gymraeg. This document is also available in Welsh.

The team who delivered the work comprised Allison Rees, Ian Phillips, Andrew Strong, and Steve Barry under the direction of Huw Rees.



# Contents

The Council can demonstrate sufficient progress in implementing the 2016 proposals for improvement and is in the process of embedding new performance management and reporting arrangements, but a decline in the proportion of staff completing mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection needs to be resolved.

Summary report	4
Appendices	
Appendix 1 – key findings	6

# Summary report

- 1 In February 2016, we published our Corporate Assessment Follow-on report, which concluded that the City of Cardiff Council (the Council) had put in place better arrangements to support improvement and to address longstanding issues, but was at a critical point in embedding them if it was to achieve a step change in delivering improved outcomes.
- 2 In February 2016, we made one formal recommendation.

## Recommendation

R1 The Council must ensure that it addresses the proposals for improvement as set out in this report to deliver improved outcomes within the next 12 months.

- 3 The Council complied with statutory requirements in response to our formal recommendation by producing a Statement of Action in March 2016.
- 4 We also made 14 proposals for improvement (PFIs) related to the following areas:
  - Leadership and Management
  - Governance
  - Performance reporting and performance management
  - Corporate Enablers
- 5 Between February and May 2017, we reviewed the Council's progress in addressing these proposals. We asked the question 'Can the Council demonstrate sufficient progress in meeting proposals for improvement made in February 2016?'
- 6 We found that the Council can demonstrate sufficient progress in implementing the 2016 proposals for improvement and is in the process of embedding new performance management and reporting arrangements, but a decline in the proportion of staff completing mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection needs to be resolved. We came to this conclusion because:
  - the Council has improved communication frameworks for staff;
  - the Council has implemented the majority of our proposals for improving governance;
  - the Council has implemented improvements to performance reporting and performance management and is in the process of embedding changes; and
  - the Council has made sufficient progress in addressing proposals for improvement across a range of corporate enabling functions but reported rates of completion of mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection are declining.
    - Human Resources: The council has made progress in developing its human resource processes and strategies.
    - Asset Management: The Council has developed its approach to asset management and is in the process of implementing improved arrangements.

- Financial Planning: The Council has addressed proposals for improvement and has a transparent and effective savings planning approach which supports financial resilience.
- Information Technology: The Council has developed a clear digital strategy and is in the process of implementing improvements although the need to address a range of technical issues has meant progress has been slower than planned.
- Information Governance: The Council has made some progress in addressing three of the four areas identified for improvement but reported rates of completion of mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection are declining.

- 7 Our findings in respect of individual proposals for improvement can be found in [Appendix 1](#). With many of the proposals for improvement we identified specific improvement actions, so in total our February 2016 report included 32 areas for attention. The Appendix provides our assessment of the progress made against each of these areas for attention.
- 8 We do not make any further proposals for improvement in this report. Our 2017-18 performance audit programme will focus on the development of performance reporting and management, assess how changes are being implemented at operational level and monitor the steps being taken to ensure improvement in the proportion of staff completing mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection.

# Appendix 1

## Key findings

The Council can demonstrate sufficient progress in implementing the 2016 proposals for improvement and is in the process of embedding new performance management and reporting arrangements, but a decline in the proportion of staff completing mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection needs to be resolved.

### Exhibit 1: proposals and key findings

Statutory Recommendation	Follow-up findings: The Council complied with statutory requirements in response to our formal recommendation by producing a Statement of Action in March 2016.
The Council must ensure that it addresses the proposals for improvement to deliver improved outcomes within the next 12 months.	<p><b>The Council met the deadline for responding to a statutory recommendation:</b> In response to the Auditor General for Wales' statutory recommendation made in February 2016, the Council responded by producing a Statement of Action within the required 30 working days.</p> <p>The Statement of Action is a process-driven document with less clarity on intended outcomes. At the time of this review between February-May 2017, the Council had yet to decide on the most appropriate approach to convey whether the Council has achieved improved outcomes. This remains a work in progress at the time of this review.</p> <p><b>The Council did not complete all actions to the timeframe initially planned:</b> The Council set clear timescales to deliver actions to address the proposals for improvement. However, not all actions were delivered as originally planned, most notably performance reporting/management proposals for improvement. Whilst key governance matters were resolved, most performance reporting and management improvements took longer than initially planned. This is a reflection of the evolving approach that was developed to ensure collaboration across key stakeholder groups and greater buy-in from services.</p>

Statutory Recommendation	Follow-up findings: The Council complied with statutory requirements in response to our formal recommendation by producing a Statement of Action in March 2016.
Undertake a review of the Council's Organisational Development programme (ODP).	<p><b>ODP 2014-17 review has been completed and a new ODP for 2017 onwards is being prepared.</b></p> <p>In May 2014, the Council established an Organisational Development Programme (ODP) to provide a framework for the Council to drive and shape significant cultural and service changes. The Council reviewed the ODP 2014-17 annually, and in 2016 re-profiled the Governance and Engagement element into Performance and Governance to directly address many of the proposals for improvement from our February 2016 report. For example, a review of scrutiny, member support and induction, business planning, performance reporting, performance support and improvement, asset management and digitalisation are ODP projects. The Policy, Review and Performance Scrutiny Committee (PRAP) and Cabinet received a report on the outcome of this review in June 2016.</p> <p>2016-17 is the final year of the current three-year ODP. In March and April 2017, the Council commissioned an independent review of the ODP. Officers are currently considering the output from this review in shaping the next iteration of the ODP.</p>

Leadership and Management	Follow-up findings: The Council has improved communication frameworks for staff
<p>P1 Develop further engagement opportunities with staff and members to consistently embed an effective performance management culture across the organisation to help deliver improved outcomes.</p>	<p><b>Implementing at an appropriate pace:</b> The intention of this proposal for improvement is drive a performance management culture across the organisation. We recognise that leading and managing such a cultural change takes time and commitment.</p> <p>The Council has established a variety of communication opportunities for senior managers to engage with employees and an Internal Communications and Engagement strategy is being implemented by the senior management team. Since January 2016, 1500 staff have attended 35 employee roadshows involving the Chief Executive and senior management team. A staff Ambassador Network has been established and consolidated with 159 staff being involved to date. Chief Executive 'Have your Say' sessions have been introduced and the Cardiff Manager Forum has also been set up. The impact of these initiatives can be seen in the Council's biennial Staff Survey results. Between 2015 and 2017, there was an improvement of the mean score from 5.55 to 6.33 of staff who agreed that 'communication/staff engagement' had improved over the last 12 months. However, the staff survey also asked a question on whether staff were clear about what is expected of them as agreed through their personal performance objectives. There has been only a small improvement in the mean score since this question was first included in the staff survey in 2013. 7.36 in 2013, a decrease to 7.12 in 2015 and an increase to 7.38 in 2017. However, with the refresh of the performance management strategy, mandatory service plans and a refresh of the PPDR process, the Council are confident that the 2019 staff survey will show further improvement.</p> <p>The member induction and support programme for the new Council contains a member 'performance information challenge workshop' scheduled for September 2017.</p>

Governance	Follow-up findings: The Council has implemented the majority of our proposals for improving governance
<p>P2 Clarify the roles and responsibilities within the Council's decision-making framework.</p>	<p><b>Ensuring that meetings of the Informal Cabinet are recorded appropriately.</b>  <b>Complete:</b> Cabinet office records action points from informal meetings of the Cabinet.</p> <p><b>Reviewing the role and membership of Cabinet Advisory Groups to ensure that those members involved do not sit on any Scrutiny Committee responsible for scrutinising the same/similar issues.</b>  <b>Complete:</b> In May 2016, Cabinet approved a terms of reference for these groups, which is more explicit depending on the role of individual groups established in the future. At the time of this review no specific Cabinet Advisory Groups were in place.</p> <p><b>Ensuring that the title and roles of Assistants to Cabinet Members are applied consistently, ensuring that their limited roles and responsibilities do not cloud any accountabilities.</b>  <b>Complete:</b> In October 2016, the Council approved the amendment to the constitution to include the role description for Assistants to Cabinet Members.</p> <p><b>Ensuring that a decision is made on the issue about whether to delegate executive decision making to individual Cabinet Members.</b>  <b>Complete:</b> In September 2016, the Constitution Committee considered a report on whether to delegate executive decision making to individual Cabinet members. The Committee concluded that with local elections scheduled for May 2017 and the need for further consideration on the potential legal framework for individual Cabinet members, no further action be taken until the matter has been considered by any new administration post May 2017.</p>

Governance	Follow-up findings
<p>P3 Further strengthen the Council's scrutiny function.</p>	<p><b>Complete in respect of 2016 report, the new Council proposes to review scrutiny arrangements in 2018:</b></p> <p>At the Council's Annual Meeting on 25 May 2017 the Council decided to retain the established scrutiny committee structure for a year prior to deciding whether any change in scrutiny structure would be beneficial.</p> <p>This proposal for improvement is therefore regarded 'complete' in respect of 2016 arrangements. We will monitor the evolution of scrutiny arrangements of the new Council as part of performance audit programme.</p> <p>The proposal for improvement made some specific points that should be referenced in the Council's future review future review:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• developing an approach to scrutinising cross cutting issues; and</li> <li>• ensuring that any vacancies on scrutiny committees are filled quickly.</li> </ul>
<p>P4 Ensure that all committee agendas, minutes and decision-logs are published in a timely manner on the Council's website, and increase the number of committees that are webcast.</p>	<p><b>Complete:</b> The publication of minutes in a timely manner is slightly (5%) under the Council's own target of 80% of minutes to be published within ten working days. The Council has extended the webcasting of Council meetings to include a number of scrutiny meetings.</p>



Governance	Follow-up findings
<p>P5 Enhance Member accountability.</p>	<p><b>Ensuring that the Standards and Ethics Committee plays a more proactive role in promoting and enforcing the Cardiff Undertaking for Councillors and supporting policies in relation to Member conduct and behaviour.</b></p> <p><b>In progress:</b> In August 2016, the Standards and Ethics Committee published its first bi-annual Member Briefing. This was a positive step in terms of the Standards and Ethics Committee taking a more proactive role. There remains scope for the Standard and Ethics Committee to raise an understanding of its role with members. This can be addressed during member induction processes in 2017.</p> <p><b>Strengthening member development and learning programmes based on competency assessments to improve skills and understanding to enable them to undertake their roles more effectively.</b></p> <p><b>In progress:</b> Considerable attention has gone into strengthening essential member training arrangements, as is evidenced by the constitution provisions report written by the Monitoring Officer for the Constitution Committee in March 2017. The report sets out options for strengthening the constitution in respect of essential Member training. At the time of this review, a small number of member competency assessments had been completed. The Council does not intend to carry out competency assessments for all members. It does intend to undertake personalised development discussions with members. The new Council has the opportunity to determine the future of member competency assessments/personalised development discussions.</p> <p><b>Determining what training should be considered essential for Members to discharge their role effectively.</b></p> <p><b>Complete:</b> The Democratic Services Committee considered a draft member induction programme in March 2017, which included essential training.</p>

Performance Reporting	Follow-up findings: The Council has implemented improvements to performance reporting and performance management and is in the process of embedding changes
<p>P6 Further strengthen performance reporting arrangements to support decision making.</p>	<p><b>Include SMART performance measures within directorate delivery plans, and ensure that these are reported to Cabinet and scrutiny to demonstrate progress.</b></p> <p><b>Complete:</b> The Council's Corporate Performance Team worked with colleagues from the wider Performance Network to peer review the Council's 2016-17 Directorate Delivery Plan to ensure they contained SMART performance measures. This approach has been further developed for 2017-18 plans.</p> <p><b>Consistently using and reporting on a Red/Amber/Green (RAG) rating for Corporate Plan commitment actions, and Directorate Plan actions, in quarterly reports provided to Scrutiny.</b></p> <p><b>In progress:</b> The Council's approach goes beyond the usual Blue, Red, Amber, Green (BRAG) rating system. Likelihood and Consequences are also contained within the Performance RAG Status Matrix. There are 16 RAG ratings in total. This system should enable consistent rating of progress towards strategic objectives. Member and officer understanding of the updated risk rating system for performance reporting will be critical to ensure correct interpretation of performance information.</p> <p><b>Mandating consistent service level plans.</b></p> <p><b>Complete:</b> The development of a service planning framework took longer than originally scheduled in order to incorporate feedback from the officers who would be responsible for using the plans. This feedback also resulted in a change of design, from a traditional report format to Balanced Scorecards, which stakeholders strongly preferred for usability reasons.</p> <p><b>Prioritising key performance indicators (KPIs) where the Council will seek to demonstrate improved performance and outcomes.</b></p> <p><b>Complete:</b> The Council's Corporate Performance Team have led the development of a new approach to Performance Reporting, which has been co-designed by colleagues from the Council's Performance Network. This has resulted in the development of a scorecard approach to reporting that focuses member scrutiny of performance on strategic performance issues.</p>

Performance Management	Follow-up findings
<p>P7 Adopt a more cohesive and co-ordinated approach to corporate enabler functions to better help the Council drive improvement.</p>	<p><b>Complete:</b> The Council has refreshed the Performance Management Strategy (PMS) that should enable effective service delivery and continued service improvement across the organisation. The establishment of the Performance Support Group has provided a mechanism through which enabling functions and front-facing services can work together to investigate and tackle the Council's performance challenges.</p>
<p>P8 Further develop the Council's performance management arrangements.</p>	<p><b>Enhance the Council's performance management strategy to include guidelines, timescales, processes, and procedures to support a consistent approach.</b></p> <p><b>Complete:</b> The review and refresh of the Council's Performance Management Strategy and Framework took longer than expected. This extra time was used to engage with officers from across the organisation ensure a collaborative approach to developing the Strategy and Framework. This approach should enable a more robust and useable performance management arrangements that have the support of the Council's directorates.</p> <p><b>Increase the level of performance management and challenge undertaken by the central performance team.</b></p> <p><b>In progress:</b> The establishment of the Performance Support Group (PSG) provides the Council with a mechanism for ensuring there is corporate oversight of operational performance, and a conduit through which to channel investigation and challenge of performance issues. The central performance team links into the PSG by undertaking analysis of performance data to inform the group's agenda, and supports the ongoing work to follow up performance issues. The members of the central performance team liaise with service-area performance leads on an ongoing basis to support continuous service improvement.</p>

Corporate Enablers Human Resources	Follow-up findings: The council has made progress in developing its human resource processes and strategies
<p>P9 Further develop the Council's Human Resource processes and strategies.</p>	<p><b>Strengthen the Council's staff appraisal process by including explicitly measurable objectives, capturing information on training on a corporate basis, and developing links to staff's future career aspirations to support workforce and succession planning</b></p> <p><b>Good progress:</b> The Personal Performance Development Review (PPDR) has been revised incorporating feedback from staff, managers, directors, the Chief Executive and Trade Unions. The revised PPDR is now available for staff and officers to use with a corporate deadline of 31 May 2017 for all staff to have received a PPDR.</p> <p>There has been a conscious effort to make personal objectives within the PPDRs measurable. Service managers have responsibility to ensure personal objectives can be measured in the future.</p> <p>The process seeks to capture learning and development needs from all staff but the way in which information will be captured corporately remains a work in progress, as does the development of links with an individual's future career aspirations to support workforce and succession planning. The Council has set a deadline of March 2018 for a corporate process for succession planning to be available across the Council. At the time of the review of this proposal for improvement in May 2017, this was in the early stages of development.</p> <p><b>Further embed the Council's workforce strategy and integrate with financial and service planning</b></p> <p><b>Good progress:</b> A workforce-planning toolkit is available to assist service areas when determining future workforce requirements. From May to July 2017, three service areas are piloting the new toolkit. Other services are engaging in workforce planning without utilising the toolkit. Feedback and a review of both approaches will help shape the roll out of the toolkit to all service areas. The introduction of this toolkit together with the requirement that all services will have a workforce action plan from 2018, and the expectation that all services have a service area balanced scorecard by June 2017, should enable the integration of workforce planning and service planning to be in place from 2018-19.</p>

Corporate Enablers Asset Management	Follow-up findings: The Council has developed its approach to asset management and is in the process of implementing improved arrangements
P10 Complete the data capture exercise relating to the use of assets, and develop a single system to hold appropriate asset management information.	<p><b>Complete with further work in progress:</b> Since this proposal for improvement was made the Council has revised its approach to the corporate landlord role. In March 2017, the Organisational Development Board adopted one operating model for all non-domestic property matters.</p> <p>The model is to be supported by suitable data systems. The Council will have three systems: Risk Assessment Management System (RAMIS), SAP (System, Applications and Products) and a new system that will link to manage and monitor non-domestic properties.</p>
P11 Ensure all outstanding actions from the Construction Excellence Wales review of the Council's building maintenance framework are completed.	<p><b>In progress:</b> In October 2015, the Council produced an action plan to support implementation of the Constructing Excellence in Wales recommendations. The Statement of Action progress report in January 2017 states that the majority of actions have been addressed however, it does not clarify which recommendations are yet to be implemented and their relative importance.</p>

Corporate Enablers Financial Planning	Follow-up findings: The Council has addressed proposals for improvement and has a transparent and effective savings planning approach which supports financial resilience
<p>P12 Further strengthen the Council's financial planning processes.</p>	<p><b>Develop more explicit links between the Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP) and the Council's improvement planning arrangements.</b></p> <p><b>Good progress:</b> The Council's Corporate Plan 2016-18 has a clear overall vision with key priorities and recognises that the implementation of strategic priorities and improvement objectives needs to be achievable within the resources for 2016-17 and set out in the Medium Term Financial Plan. The Council's MTFP is aligned with the Corporate Plan and other key strategies such as the Organisational Development Plan and workforce planning but the MTFP is less explicit about budget allocation for corporate priorities.</p> <p><b>Strengthen links between the Medium Term Financial Plan and service plans.</b></p> <p><b>Complete:</b> The Council has improved the links between its MTFP and its service plans. The Council's 2016-17 Directorate Delivery Plans include the directorate savings and provide appropriate narrative to support this.</p> <p><b>Ensure that savings proposals, owned by Directorates, are linked to the Organisational Development Programme where relevant, are fully costed, and that delivery is driven by the Organisational Development Programme Board and ensure all budget savings plans are fully developed as appropriate with realistic timescales when the annual budget is set.</b></p> <p><b>In progress:</b> The Council is in the process of strengthening arrangements by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• ensuring that all savings proposals are fully developed prior to the start of the year with realistic timescales when the annual budget is set;</li> <li>• developing an Income Generation/Charging Policy; and</li> <li>• continuing to develop links between the Organisational Development Plan and annual savings.</li> </ul>

<b>Corporate Enablers ICT</b>	<b>Follow-up findings: The Council has developed a clear digital strategy and is in the process of implementing improvements although the need to address a range of technical issues has meant progress has been slower than planned</b>
P13 Further strengthen the Council's IT arrangements.	<p><b>Further develop the draft Digital ICT strategy and formally agree this strategic vision for delivering digitally enabled services.</b></p> <p><b>Completed:</b> May 2016, Cabinet approved the strategic vision for delivering digitally enabled services.</p> <p><b>Deploy the Customer Relationship Management (CRM) system fully to appropriate services across the Council.</b></p> <p><b>Slower progress than planned:</b> A combination of reduced staff capacity and technical issues has meant that deployment has not progressed as quickly as originally planned. CRM deployment began in December 2015, with a three phase implementation intended to be completed by the end of 2018. The Council has initiated Phase 1 of the CRM deployment but has encountered a number of technical challenges and performance issues with the cloud based CRM system. Phase 1 of the CRM deployment with the Council's contact centre is progressing. The Council is working with the supplier of the CRM system, SAP (System, Applications and Products), on a number of technical and performance issues. These issues are being investigated within the supplier's network of expertise to seek a resolution. Since February 2017, the Council has reported an improvement in the performance of the CRM system for standard contact centre calls that require relatively simple workflow. The departure of the Council's chief enterprise architect from the CRM implementation team created a staff capacity issue. The Council is currently taking action to recruit to the vacancy and has commissioned an independent review of the CRM project implementation to identify potential options, lesson learned and a future roadmap to make improvements. The Council is expecting the review report and proposals in June 2017.</p> <p>In addition, the Council is working with SAP to develop proposals for the delivery of the remaining CRM project phases by the supplier. The Council is planning to review the SAP proposals and deployment plans at the end of June 2017.</p>

Corporate Enablers ICT	<p><b>Follow-up findings: The Council has developed a clear digital strategy and is in the process of implementing improvements although the need to address a range of technical issues has meant progress has been slower than planned</b></p>
	<p><b>Implement the mobile scheduling and flexible working technologies where appropriate</b></p> <p><b>Good progress:</b> The Council has made good progress in deploying flexible working and mobile scheduling technologies across the organisation. The Council has 4,400 staff who use IT services and 1,750 of these have the ability to gain remote access to the corporate network through a laptop device to work flexibly. Flexible working technologies allow staff to complete work outside of their usual office environment for example, at other Council offices and at home. In addition, 2,100 Council staff have remote access to email services from a smart phone or mobile device.</p> <p>Mobile scheduling technologies allow staff who deliver front line services, to receive scheduled work and then document completion of this work electronically and remotely, without the need to have a fixed desk at a Council office. The Council has piloted and implemented the mobile scheduling technology model and has demonstrated that benefits are deliverable and this approach works as intended. To date, mobile scheduling is used by staff in Community Maintenance Services and for Social Services carers. The Council is taking a phased approach to deploy mobile scheduling and is currently exploring its potential for other areas. The Council is currently developing a business case to deploy mobile scheduling to Waste Management services.</p> <p><b>Expand the number and depth of ICT key performance indicators (KPIs) measured and reported, to cover the whole ICT service, and benchmark against public service comparators</b></p> <p><b>Complete:</b> The Council has reviewed and expanded the number of Key Performance Indicators (KPI's) that are measured, reported, and benchmarked with other Local Authority comparators. The Council has worked with the Society of Information Technology Management (SOCITM) Wales and the Welsh Unitary Authority ICT leads to discuss a common approach to KPI's across Wales but also with reference to wider SOCITM member KPIs within English authorities. The Council has led on the procurement of an all-Wales SOCITM benchmarking exercise which benchmarked aspects such as digital maturity, IT maturity, IT performance and IT cost effectiveness and has used the outcomes of these exercises to inform potential KPI's for the future. The Council use a number of indicators to measure IT performance. One additional indicator was added in March 2017, on the level of devices that are used to support mobility and agile working.</p> <p>The Council will need to consider and review how it assesses the future performance of the IT service with the deployment of the digital strategy and services to reflect new ways of using information technology.</p>



Corporate Enablers Information Management	Follow-up findings: The Council has some made progress in addressing three of the four areas identified for improvement but reported rates of completion of mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection are declining
<p>P14 Further strengthen the Council's information governance arrangements.</p>	<p><b>Complete the outstanding actions from the Information Commissioner's Office June 2014 audit on data protection and information confidentiality.</b></p> <p><b>In progress:</b> The Council has made progress and has completed most actions from the Information Commissioner's Office (ICO's) action plan. As at May 2017, 4 out of the ICO's 36 recommendations remained in progress, were awaiting further action or were partially implemented, for example, improving the arrangements for the County Hall building security. The ICO followed up their original 2014 audit in early 2015.</p> <p><b>Increase the level of staff completion of the Council's information confidentiality and data protection e-learning training programme.</b></p> <p><b>Council reports show a decline in performance:</b> Council data shows a year on year reduction in the proportion of staff completing the mandatory information confidentiality and data protection e-learning training programme. All staff with access to a corporate email address are expected to complete the e-learning training. There is a completion target of 85% of staff. In October 2015, 81% of staff were reported as having completed this training. The Information Security Board (ISB) received a report that in 2016, 73% of staff had completed training. This is a decrease in the number of staff complying with this mandatory training. As at May 2017, completion rates ranged from 61% in Education to 79% in the Resources directorates.</p> <p>The Council has experienced technical issues with the supplier and is working with the company to reload the registration details for all staff onto the new version of the e-learning package during July to September 2017.</p>

<b>Corporate Enablers Information Management</b>	<b>Follow-up findings: The Council has some made progress in addressing three of the four areas identified for improvement but reported rates of completion of mandatory training in information confidentiality and data protection are declining</b>
	<p><b>Fully implement the Electronic Records Management System across the Council.</b>  <b>Slower progress than planned:</b> The Council has made limited progress in fully implementing the Electronic Records Management System (ERMS) across the Council. Whilst all staff have access to view content on the ERMS, only staff in 14 out of the 71 Council sites can add documents to ERMS. The Council is currently recruiting and seeking funding for additional resources to accelerate the deployment of the EDRMS and train staff to use the system. The Council has not yet set a target date for the completion of the EDRMS project.</p> <p><b>Improve the Council's response rates against statutory targets in respect of data protection subject access requests, and Freedom of Information Act requests.</b>  <b>In progress:</b> The Council has made progress to improve the response rates against statutory targets. The response rate to Freedom of Information requests was 89% in 2016-17 compared to 80% in 2015-16. In 2016-17, 95% of subject access requests made under the Data Protection Act met the statutory target. The Council is planning to establish a new centralised approach to information request handling from 1 July 2017 with the aim of improving the consistency, response rates and quality of request responses.</p> <p><b>Complete a Caldicott Principles<sup>1</sup> into Practice self-assessment.</b>  <b>Complete:</b> In May 2016, the Council put into practice the self-assessment of the 'Caldicott: Principles into Practice'. The Council's Information Governance team and Director of Social Services (the Caldicott lead) have assessed compliance against the Caldicott requirements and developed an improvement plan. The 'Caldicott: Principles into Practice' self-assessment was reported to the Information Security Board in September 2016.</p>

<sup>1</sup> Source: <http://www.wales.nhs.uk/nwis/page/52658>

In 1997, Dame Caldicott led a review into how Patient-Identifiable Information was handled in the NHS. The 'Caldicott Report' made a number of recommendations for regulating the use and transfer of patient-identifiable information.



Wales Audit Office  
24 Cathedral Road  
Cardiff CF11 9LJ

Tel: 029 2032 0500

Fax: 029 2032 0600

Textphone: 029 2032 0660

E-mail: [info@audit.wales](mailto:info@audit.wales)

Website: [www.audit.wales](http://www.audit.wales)

Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru  
24 Heol y Gadeirlan  
Caerdydd CF11 9LJ

Ffôn: 029 2032 0500

Ffacs: 029 2032 0600

Ffôn testun: 029 2032 0660

E-bost: [post@archwilio.cymru](mailto:post@archwilio.cymru)

Gwefan: [www.archwilio.cymru](http://www.archwilio.cymru)